Obesity research confirms long-term weight loss almost impossible

No known cure for obesity except surgically shrinking the stomach

By Kelly Crowe, CBC News Posted: Jun 04, 2014 5:00 PM ET | Last Updated: Jun 04, 2014 10:34 PM ET



The nasty reality is that humans are efficient biological machines. "We have evolved not to lose weight." (Reuters)



Stay Connected with CBC News



Permanent weight loss is a losing battle 2:23











Kelly Crowe Medical science

Kelly Crowe is a medical sciences correspondent

There's a disturbing truth that is emerging from the science of obesity. After years of study, it's becoming apparent that it's nearly impossible to permanently lose weight.

As incredible as it sounds, that's what the evidence is showing. For psychologist Traci Mann, who has spent 20 years running an eating lab at the University of Minnesota, the evidence is clear. "It couldn't be easier to see," she says. "Long-term weight loss happens to only the smallest minority of people."

We all think we know someone in that rare group. They become the legends — the friend of a friend, the brother-in-law, the neighbour — the ones who really did it.

But if we check back after five or 10 years, there's a good chance they will have put the weight back on. Only about five per cent of people who try to lose weight ultimately succeed, according to the research. Those people are the outliers, but we cling to their stories as proof that losing weight is possible.

"Those kinds of stories really keep the myth alive," says University of Alberta professor Tim Caulfield, who researches and writes about health misconceptions. "You have this confirmation bias going on where people point to these very specific examples as if it's proof. But in fact those are really exceptions."

Our biology taunts us, by making short-term weight loss fairly easy. But the weight creeps back, usually after about a year, and it keeps coming back until the original weight is regained or worse.

This has been tested in randomized controlled trials where people have

Top News Headlines



■ Moncton shooting suspect charged with 3 counts of 1st-degree murder ♣

- D-Day Live: Experience the historic invasion in real time
- Moncton shootings: Vigils honour slain, wounded Mounties ...
- Hammer attack on Windsor boy, 13, probed by police
- Parvaz Film Corp. blacklisted following CBC Go Public investigation

Must Watch



Lyme disease on the move

1:59

The number of infected people is on the rise,



Permanent weight loss is a losing battle

2.23

After years of study, it's becoming apparent that



for CBC News, specializing in health and biomedical research. She joined CBC in 1991, and has spent 25 years reporting on a wide range of national news and current affairs, with a particular interest in science and medicine.

Related Stories

- Obese, overweight population hits 2.1 billion worldwide
- Child obesity fuelled bystress response
- Canada's obesity rate higher since global recession: OFCD
- Obesity to overtake smoking as worst heart disease risk factor
- Weight-loss surgeries leap in Canada, study says

External Links

- 1959 review on results of treatment for obesity, JAMA
- Global, regional, and national prevalence of overweight and obesity, The Lancet
- Lancet commentary

(Note: CBC does not endorse and is not responsible for the content of external links.) been separated into groups and given intense exercise and nutrition counselling.

Even in those highly controlled experimental settings, the results show only minor sustained weight loss.

When Traci Mann analyzed all of the randomized control trials on longterm weight loss, she discovered that after two years the average amount lost was only one kilogram, or about two pounds, from the original weight.

Tiptoeing around the truth

So if most scientists know that we can't eat ourselves thin, that the lost weight will ultimately bounce back, why don't they say so?

Tim Caulfield says his fellow obesity academics tend to tiptoe around the truth. "You go to these meetings and you talk to researchers, you get a sense there is almost a political correctness around it, that we don't want this message to get out there," he said.

"You'll be in a room with very knowledgeable individuals, and everyone in the room will know what the data says and still the message doesn't seem to get out."

In part, that's because it's such a harsh message. "You have to be careful about the stigmatizing



Last fall, the Dubai government launched a 30-day weight loss challenge called "Your Weight in Gold" to encourage dieters and combat growing obesity in the Gulf Arab enrirate. It should probably save its money if the current science is right. (Reuters)

nature of that kind of image," Caulfield says. "That's one of the reasons why this myth of weight loss lives on."

Health experts are also afraid people will abandon all efforts to exercise and eat a nutritious diet — behaviour that is important for health and longevity — even if it doesn't result in much weight loss.

Traci Mann says the emphasis should be on measuring health, not weight. "You should still eat right, you should still exercise, doing healthy stuff is still healthy," she said. "It just doesn't make you thin."

We are biological machines

But eating right to improve health alone isn't a strong motivator. The research shows that most people are willing to exercise and limit caloric intake if it means they will look better. But if they find out their weight probably won't change much, they tend to lose motivation.

That raises another troubling question. If diets don't result in weight loss, what does? At this point the grim answer seems to be that there is no known cure for obesity, except perhaps surgically shrinking the stomach.

'Healthy stuff is still healthy, it just doesn't make you thin'

- Traci Mann, University of Mnnesota

Research suggests bariatric surgery can induce weight loss in the extremely obese, improving health and quality of life at the same time. But most people will still be obese after the surgery. Plus, there are risky side effects, and many will end up gaining some of that weight back.

If you listen closely you will notice that obesity specialists are quietly adjusting the message through a subtle change in language.

These days they're talking about weight maintenance or "weight management" rather than "weight loss."

It's a shift in emphasis that reflects the emerging reality. Just last week the headlines announced the world is fatter than



Pauline Dakin report



Radon gas alert

5:12

Millions of Canadians are being exposed to radon gas in their homes, a potentially deadly threat it's nearly impossible to permanently lose weight



Home radon gas detection primer

7:47

Interview with Bob Wood, president of the Canadian Association of Radon Scientists and Technologists

Latest Health News Headlines



■ Quebec end-of-life-care law means new era for health providers ☐ 199

- Rare childhood disease diagnosis clues a comfort to families
- Malnutrition and the microbiome
- Mothers buy dream home for sons with severe disabilities 171
- Is long-term weight loss impossible? CBC readers divided



High radon levels found in Health Canada tests across country

Radon is the leading cause of lung cancer in Canada among nonsmokers

Most Viewed

- Rare childhood disease diagnosis clues a comfort to families
- Obesity research confirms long-term weight loss almost impossible
- 8 Lyme disease prevention tips to heed as ticks spread
- Formaldehyde found in more hair products
- Oil pulling: Ancient practice now a modern trend
- Understanding E. coli: symptoms, spread, prevention
- Chikungunya virus infects 12 more in Guyana
- Heart disease: treatment using vegetables over drugs
- Stroke success in Canada could be strained
- Vanity, sunscreen fatigue behind the rise in skin cancer

it has ever been, with 2.1 billion people now overweight or obese, based on an

analysis published in the online issue of the British medical journal The Lancet.



Michelle Obama has been on an eat better campaign ever since her husband was elected to the White House. An estimated 2.1 billion people on the planet are now considered overweight or obese. (Reuters)

Researchers are divided about why weight gain seems to be irreversible, probably a combination of biological and social forces. "The fundamental reason," Caulfield says, "is that we are very efficient biological machines. We evolved not to lose weight. We evolved to keep on as much weight as we possibly can."

Lost in all of the noise about dieting and obesity is the difficult concept of prevention, of not putting weight on in the first place.

The Lancet study warned that more than one in five kids in developed countries are now overweight or obese. Statistics Canada says close to a third of Canadian kids under 17 are overweight or obese. And in a world flooded with food, with enormous economic interest in keeping people eating that food, what is required to turn this ship around is daunting.

"An appropriate rebalancing of the primal needs of humans with food availability is essential," University of Oxford epidemiologist Klim McPherson wrote in a Lancet commentary following last week's study. But to do that, he suggested, "would entail curtailing many aspects of production and marketing for food industries."

Perhaps, though, the emerging scientific reality should also be made clear, so we can navigate this obesogenic world armed with the stark truth — that we are held hostage to our biology, which is adapted to gain weight, an old evolutionary advantage that has become a dangerous metabolic liability.

Facebook V Twitter	₹ Reddit	203	Share	Email
Report Typo				

Comments on this story are moderated according to our Submission Guidelines. Comments are welcome while open. We reserve the right to close comments at any time.

Login | Signup

1419 Comments

Commenting on this article has been closed.

Send Feedback

Follow Newest



Don't diet!!! Fool your body into losing weight. Decrease portion sizes but not too much, get more exercise, but not too much. Stay away from processed foods, eat natural. That means limiting eating out cuz that food is loaded with hidden fats and especially salt. I've lost 15 pounds so far, it has taken a long time, but my body has no idea that it has been getting ever so slightly smaller.

1 day ago 15 Likes





Qwerty

Hogwash

Obesity rates are a direct result of industry. Highly processed, calorie dense, nutritionally bereft 'food' products are scientifically formulated to ensure over consumption. Then, they are advertised incessantly to convince us that they are somehow acceptable. What used to be viewed as a treat is now daily fare. And the companies behind the products laugh all the way to the bank.

The diet industry is no better. They have no interest in solving a problem that makes them billions every... » more



Jannette Beard

OK why is the only people quoted here NOT trained in actual human metabolic science?? where is the link to this study?

Traci Mann: Ph.D.: Psychology, Stanford University, 1995.

Klim McPherson: Nuffield Department of Obstetrics and Gynaecology

Timothy Caulfield: BSc (Alberta), LL.B. (Alberta), LL.M. (Dalhousie), Canada Research Chair in Health Law and Policy; Trudeau Fellow; Senior Health Scholar, Alberta Heritage Foundation for Medical Research; Professor, Faculty of Law and School of... » more

1 day ago 25 Likes

Lik e

Shar



Corn_Dog

Lazy journalism, misleading. Expect more from Kelly Crowe.

1 day ago 20 Likes

Lik e

Sha e



diabetic in calgary

Diagnosed with diabetes Dec 2013 with a HbA1c of 9.1 mmol/l. Normal in Calgary as per the lab is 4.3 to 6.1 mmol/l. At the next blood test in May 2014 the HbA1c glucose dropped to 5.6 mmol/l, which is normal. Along with the high glucose my waist was 114 mm (now 106), high triglycerides and LDL cholesterol. The HDL cholesterol in good. I think the secret to fat loss is to do what your grandma did in the 1960's to stay slim before the politicians started playing with our countries health and... » more

1 day ago 7 Likes

Lik

Sh

е



Ann Marie

If people would eat real food instead of the processed crap that is on most of the store shelves they may be surprised at how they feel and weigh. I am losing weight slowly but steadily since I changed my eating habits.

1 day ago 17 Likes

Lik e

Sha

е



Owmcgoer

I am currently going through an excellent program through the Ottawa Weight Management Clinic at the Ottawa Hospital. I know that the biggest hurdle will not be losing the weight, but keeping it off. This article is irresponsible. What is Kelly saying? That we, the overweight, should all just give up and keep eating or that we all should risk serious complications or even death via bariatric surgery? Is the fact that keeping weight off is hard really news? Very poor reporting.

1 day ago 12 Likes

Lik e

Sha

е



karen

Surely this only happens because people can't stick to a restrictive diet for the rest of their lives, and once they stop the diet, the weight comes back on. If you were able to lose the weight in the first place, and you stuck with the same eating programme for life, then you wouldn't return to your original weight.

It is incredibly hard, and I speak as one of the ones who can't do it!! The reason I can't do it is purely because I lack willpower which I am sure is the case for so many of ... » more

Lik e Shar e



RaspberryGirl

I read this article yesterday, and have to admit it made me angry. I was almost afraid to check back to see comments, but am pleased and refreshed to see that common sense appears to be prevailing.

I think that Kelly Crowe and the CBC have done the Canadian public a disservice by publishing this piece. It makes gross assumptions and neglects to include the most basic of definitions or explanations. Is obesity due to lifestyle and obesity due to physiological issues (endocrine problems, etc.)... » more

1 day ago 26 Likes

Lik

Shar

e e



TryPositiveThinking

No know cure for obesity. That's like saying no known cure for smoking.

1 day ago 22 Likes

LIK

Sha

е

Show More

Submission Policy

Note: The CBC does not necessarily endorse any of the views posted. By submitting your comments, you acknowledge that CBC has the right to reproduce, broadcast and publicize those comments or any part thereof in any manner whatsoever. Please note that comments are moderated and published according to our submission guidelines.

Don't Miss





CBC.ca **CORPORATE** Aboriginal Kids' CBC Wonder World About CBC Subscriptions **Public Appearances** Pitch a Radio or Audio Program **CBC** Player Books Music Transparency and Accountability Contests News **CBC Shop** Jobs Program and Content Sales Digital Archives **Production Facilities** Archive Sales **Parents** Documentaries Program Guide Mobile Production Rentals Educational Sales Kids Image Research Library & Still Photos Radio Ombudsman Kids' CBC Preschool Sports CBC: Get the Facts Consumer Recordings Independent Producers Digital TV Television STAY CONNECTED MOBILE PODCASTS MEMBER SERVICES: NEWSLETTERS & ALERTS CBC Radio-Canada Terms Of Use Reuse & Permissions Contact Us Advertise Privacy Site Map Help Copyright © CBC 2014 radio-canada.ca cbc.radio-canada.ca cbc.ca